# COUNTY OF MILWAUKEE Inter-Office Communication

Date:

February 21, 2012

To:

Lynne De Bruin, Vice Chair, Committee on Finance and Audit

Michael Mayo, Chair, Committee on Transportation, Public Works & Transit

From:

Jerome J. Heer, Director of Audits

Subject:

Status Report – Audit of County Preventive Maintenance Program (File No. 10-389)

At its meeting on October 28, 2010, the Committee on Finance and Audit passed a motion to refer our audit report "Milwaukee County Needs to Commit to a Preventive Repair & Maintenance Program to Ensure Public Safety," to the Committee on Transportation, Public Works and Transit to "read the response from Public Works and develop a plan to move forward."

At the Committee on Transportation, Public Works and Transit meeting on January 19, 2011, a motion to receive and place the report on file was approved. Additionally, the Committee Chair directed that a report be brought back in six months on the progress of the inspections, recommendations for the 2012 budget, and a list of all 902 County buildings. In response to this directive, the Department of Transportation and Public Works (DTPW) submitted a report dated August 22, 2011, to your respective committees.

Additionally, a status report describing DTPW's progress toward implementation of our audit report recommendations was reviewed by both your committees during the September 2011 meeting cycle.

DAS management describes its recent efforts and plans to implement the outstanding recommendations in the current status report, attached for your review. As noted in the report, the majority of the recommendations remain outstanding due to funding challenges and to an extent, the long-range nature of some of the recommendations.

This status report is informational.

Jerome J. Heer

JJH/PAG/cah

Attachment

CC:

Finance and Audit Committee Members
Transportation, Public Works and Transit Committee Members
Chris Abele, Milwaukee County Executive
Patrick Farley, Director, Department of Administrative Services
Terrence Cooley, Chief of Staff, County Board Staff

Steve Cady, Research Analyst, County Board Staff Martin Weddle, Research Analyst, County Board Staff

Carol Mueller, Chief Committee Clerk

Jodi Mapp, Committee Clerk, County Board Staff

Audit Date: October 2010 Sta	itus Rep	ort Da	ate: F	ebruary	16, 2012	Depa	rtment: Transportation & Public Works
Number & Recommendation	Dead Establ			dlines ieved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
Draft a policy, for County Board consideration, establishing minimum standards for assessing, inspecting and maintaining proper building conditions.					Yes	No	August 2011 Response:  A policy appears to already be in place. Section 56.20 of the County Ordinances states "Administration of all public works projects shall be the function of and centralized in the Department of Transportation and Public Works".  Administration is defined to include "establishment of a program for maintaining structural integrity of all capital improvements and routine major maintenance." Based on existing County Ordinance Section 56.20, DTPW staff is developing a DTPW Director mandated county-wide annual building inspection program for "maintaining structural integrity of all capital improvements and routine major maintenance."  In the 2011 Adopted Budget 5 skilled trade positions (Inspection Unit) were created in the DTPW Director's Office but not funded for Building Inspections. Once this DTPW inspection team has been assembled, they will visit all County facilities on an annual basis using a recently developed "Inspection Manual for Building Components and Other Structures". The inspections performed by this unit would take into account the VFA data, as well as pending capital requests for each building. The Property Management (PM) Units will be provided a list of deficiencies that the inspectors have found on each building. This notification process would provide a record of current building condition, and highlight the immediate necessary remedies that would make sure public safety is not compromised. Inspection reports will be generated and submitted to the PM Units with the directive to implement any repair or removal of imminent threat to employee or public safety. If, upon revisiting the facilities, the directed repair or removal of imminent threats has not been completed, a report to the County Board will be generated.

Number & Recommendation	Deadlines Established		Deadlines Achieved		Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							Concurrently. DTPW recognizes that PM Units will want to be proactive in confirming that the buildings they are responsible for maintaining are in compliance. In Januar each year, all PM Units will be required to submit to the Director of DTPW a copy of an inspection checklist that the completed for each appropriate building and/or structure which they are responsible. A listing of buildings will be established with and for each PM Unit. A similar process be established for all County buildings leased, operated a maintained by third parties  February 2012 Response:  The policy required for establishing minimum standards frassessing, inspecting and maintaining proper building conditions is in place.  In the February 2012 committee cycle, the County Board approved revisions to Chapters 44 and 56 of the Code of Ordinances as it pertains to contract of a public works na based on the provisions of the 2012 Adopted Budget. As result, based on existing County Ordinance Section 56.2 DAS-Facilities Management Division (DAS-FM) staff is developing a DAS Director mandated county-wide annual building inspection program for "maintaining structural integrity of all capital improvements and routine major maintenance."

Number & Recommendation	Deadli Establi			dlines ieved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
Request sufficient funding to perform proactive, cyclical assessments and inspections of County-owned infrastructure assets.					Yes, assuming future budgets include required funding.		August 2011 Response:  In 2010, DTPW requested and received funding of \$1.6 million in the adopted 2011 Capital Budget to assess the condition of all County facilities that had not yet been included in DTPW's existing Building Inventory and Assessment Program (VFA). \$1.2 million was provided from various airport accounts for airport facilities. Building assessment tasks at the airports are ongoing. All other assessments have been delayed due to a delay in receipt the funding revenue from land sales.  The process of performing assessments and inspections in the first step in understanding the extent of building condition. From the inspection, a determination must be made regarding the severity of the structural condition and the immediacy of the repair. Therefore, in terms of establishing funding for assessments and inspections, the process must be broken down into three parts; building assessment and inspection, cost of repair and the timefra for repair. This must be done for interior as well as exterior assessments.  DTPW is proposing an Inspection Unit identified earlier. Unit will inevitably refine the inspection and assessment process over time producing better cost estimating for successives. In the mean time, establishing a cost base line cyclical assessments and inspections will be based on recent work performed by the façade inspections done county owned buildings. Costs for façade evaluations are expected to be \$350,000 to \$400,000 annually based on inspections required by City ordinances. Necessary repaineded based on inspection findings are difficult to estim given the variety of building materials and their costs and

Number & Recommendation	Deadl Establi			dlines ieved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
						Required	extent of the needed repair.  Interior evaluations could be performed for a cost of roug \$150,000 to \$200,000 annually assuming 120 buildings would be inspected once every 5 years. This level of analysis would be done using the expertise of the inspectunit with necessary repair work being the responsibility of owner department.  February 2012 Response:  ORGANIZATIONAL CHANGES BEING IMPLEMENTED In the 2011 Adopted Budget, 5 skilled trade positions (Inspection Unit) were created in the DTPW Director's Of but not funded for Building Inspections. In the 2012 Adopted Budget these positions remain unfunded in the budget of Director of the Department of Transportation (DOT). The positions will be reallocated to DAS-Facilities Managemed Division in 2013. Also in the 2012 Adopted Budget certal significant organizational changes within DAS were approved that are currently being implemented. This
							involves filling newly created positions of the DAS-FM Director, the Director of the Sustainability Section of DAS FM and the Manager of the Facilities Maintenance Section DAS-FM as well as the existing position of Mechanical Services Manager. Some of these positions are in the process of recruitment and others are proceeding throug the HR process. Filling of supervisory skilled trade positions are in the process of the trade positions are in the process of recruitment and others are proceeding throug the HR process. Filling of supervisory skilled trade positions are under the trade position of the trade posi

Audit Date: October 2010	Status Repo	ort Da	te: Fe	bruary	16, 2012	Depa	rtment: Transportation & Public Works
Number & Recommendation	Deadl Establi			dlines eved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							Anticipating that these leadership positions will be filled by mid-year, the department plans to further formalize the "Inspection Unit" concept that requires visiting all County facilities on an annual basis using a recently developed "Inspection Manual for Building Components and Other Structures". This was described in the 8/22/11 DTPW report and 8/30/12 Audit report to the County Board. These revisions may delay the implementation of this concept but a more centralized and efficient inspection program will result.  On a related initiative, per the 2012 Adopted Budget, DAS-FM is in the process of negotiating a contract with consulting firm of CB Richard Ellis to deliver a Comprehensive Facilities Plan for County buildings.  Reallocation of existing or additional fiscal resources may be required for further implementation in the 2013 budget.  In the interim, DAS-FM is emphasizing to PM Units that they need to be proactive in confirming that the buildings they are responsible for maintaining are in compliance. In January of each year, all PM Units will be required to submit to the Director of DAS-FM a copy of an inspection checklist that they completed for each appropriate building and/or structure for which they are responsible. A listing of buildings will be established with and for each PM Unit. A similar process will be established for all County buildings leased, operated and maintained by third parties.  OUTCOME AND STATUS OF RECENT ASSESSMENTS AND INSPECTIONS OF COUNTY-OWNED INFRASTRUCTURE ASSETS

Number & Recommendation	Deadlir Establis	- 1	Deadli Achie	ſ	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							The process of performing assessments and inspections the first step in understanding the extent of building condition. From the inspection, a determination must be made regarding the severity of the structural condition and the immediacy of the repair. Therefore, in terms of establishing funding for assessments and inspections, the process must be broken down into three parts; building assessment and inspection, cost of repair and the timefrator repair. This must be done for interior as well as exterior assessments.  Building Inventory and Assessment Program (VFA)  In 2010, DTPW requested and received funding of \$1.6 million in the adopted 2011 Capital Budget to assess the condition of all County facilities that had not yet been included in DTPW's existing Building Inventory and Assessment Program (VFA). \$1.2 million was provided from various airport accounts for airport facilities. Building assessment tasks at the airports are ongoing. All other assessments have been delayed due to a delay in receipt the funding revenue from land sales.  Annual Budget Allocation  DAS-FM is proposing an Inspection Unit as identified at This unit will inevitably refine the inspection and assess process over time producing better cost estimating for suservices. In the mean time, establishing a cost base line cyclical assessments and inspections will be based on recent work performed by the façade inspections done county owned buildings. Costs for façade evaluations a expected to be \$350,000 to \$400,000 annually based or

Number & Recommendation	Dead Establ			dlines ieved	Implementa	tion Status	
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	Comments
							inspections required by City ordinances. Necessary repairs needed based on inspection findings are difficult to estimate given the variety of building materials and their costs and the extent of the needed repair.  Interior evaluations could be performed for a cost of roughly \$150,000 to \$200,000 annually assuming 120 buildings would be inspected once every 5 years. This level of analysis would be done using the expertise of the inspection unit with necessary repair work being the responsibility of the owner department.
Draft a framework for consolidating all property management functions within DTPW to ensure focused, streamlined building management in a manner that ensures the safety of the public and County employees.		No			No	Yes	August 2011 Response:  DTPW agrees that consolidation of all county owned property should be under one property management function as proposed both by an earlier audit report as well as a previous budget request. A stand-alone Department could be created to ensure building management is streamlined and that maintenance of county owned property is prioritize in an unbiased manner with safety as the priority.  Dept. of Audit Comment:  We reiterate our recommendation that a framework be drafted which consolidates all property management functions Countywide within DTPW to provide the benefits noted in our report.
	-				1		February 2012 Response:

Number & Recommendation	Deadli Establis		dlines ieved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments	
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							should be under one property management function proposed both by an earlier audit report as well as a previous budget request. As out-lined in the 2012 Ac Budget and in subsequent informational reports to the County Board, DAS-FM has been created to ensure management is streamlined and that maintenance of owned property is prioritized in an unbiased manner safety as the priority. The adopted budget action created to ensure management functions Countywide within DAS to provide benefits noted in the 2010 Audit report. Subsequently budget initiatives to further consolidate all property management functions Countywide under DAS-FM and anticipated in 2013.  On a related initiative, per the 2012 Adopted Budget FM is in the process of negotiating a contract with confirm of CB Richard Ellis to deliver a Comprehensive Plan for County buildings and properties. This plan provide a strategy, timeline and cost estimates to im the Milwaukee County property management strategy.

Number & Recommendation	Deadlines Established		Deadlines Achieved		Implementation Status		Comments	
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required		
Establish a protocol that ensures that data concerning repair and maintenance work completed to address identified deficiencies are input into VFA, and that completed work be archived as appropriate.		No			No	Yes	August 2011 Response: For many of the public works capital budget projects, DTPV is already working on inputting data concerning repair and maintenance work completed to address identified deficiencies into VFA, and that completed work be archived as appropriate. For most other public works projects performed for the Owner departments by T&M contractors by county staff, DTPW still needs to coordinate with the Owner Departments to make the data available to DTPW.  DTPW staff is working with all PM Units to develop a process and procedure that ensures data concerning repair and maintenance work completed to address identified deficiencies are input into VFA, and that data on the completed work is archived as appropriate. This will include access and training on the appropriate property management software.  February 2012 Response:  For many of the public works capital budget projects, DAS FM staff is already working on inputting data concerning repair and maintenance work completed to address identified deficiencies into VFA, and that completed work is archived as appropriate. For most other public works projects performed for the Owner departments by T&M contractors or by county staff, DAS-FM still needs to coordinate with the Owner Departments to make the data available to DAS-FM.  DAS-FM staff is working with all PM Units to develop a process and procedure that ensures data concerning repair and maintenance work completed to address identified deficiencies are input into VFA, and that data on the	

Number & Recommendation	Dead Establ		Deadlines Achieved		Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
		A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A					completed work is archived as appropriate. This will include access and training on the appropriate property management software.
Ensure that assessment results are discussed with PM units prior to entering the data into VFA. If disagreement exists, establish a procedure for arbitrating the disagreement, and for subsequently identifying such deficiencies within VFA.		No			No	Yes	August 2011 Response:  DTPW staff has put in place a review process allowing for adequate opportunities for PM Unit staff to review and comment on the data collected. A challenge to this proces is the lack of staff and resources for the Owner department to allocate time for those with the expertise necessary. A procedure for arbitrating any disagreement between DTP and the PM Units will be developed that allows subseque identifying such deficiencies within VFA.
							February 2012 Response:  DAS-FM staff has put in place a review process allowing adequate opportunities for PM Unit staff to review and comment on the data collected. A challenge to this proces is the lack of staff and resources for the Owner department to allocate time for those with the expertise necessary. A procedure for arbitrating any disagreement between DAS FM and the PM Units will be developed that allows subsequent consensus in identifying building system inventory, condition and deficiencies within the VFA

Audit Date: October 20	)10 <b>Stat</b>	us Rep	ort Da	te: Fe	ebruary	16, 2012	Depa	rtment: Transportation & Public Works
Number & Rec	commendation	Dead Establ			dlines ieved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
		Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
								program.
Require PM units to deficiencies and up their proper status, directed toward Prideficiencies initially	date VFA to reflect with emphasis ority 1, Life Safety		No			No	Yes	August 2011 Response: As a part of the DTPW Director mandated county-wide annual building inspection program being worked on by DTPW staff, the PM Units will be required to document their review of the VFA data.  DTPW staff will work with all PM Units and DAS fiscal and budget staff to develop a process and procedure that requires PM Units to review all open deficiencies and update VFA to reflect their proper status, with emphasis directed toward budgeting in the operating or capital budget to address Priority 1, Life Safety deficiencies initially. Requested budget submittals will require back up documentation from the VFA database. This will process and procedure will include access and training on the appropriate property management software.  A challenge to this process is the lack of staff and resources for the PM Unit to allocate time for those with the expertise necessary.  Dept. of Audit Comment: Our recommendation was intended to confirm whether the open deficiency status noted in VFA was current and accurate, with attention focused first on Priority 1, Life Safet deficiencies. Once the status was confirmed, then the response by DTPW to budget for repair costs is an appropriate natural extension of its corrective action.  Until then, neither DAS involvement nor limitations with staff's knowledge of VFA functions should restrict PM units'

udit Date: October 2010	Status Repo	ort Da	te: Fe	ebruary	16, 2012	Depa	rtment: Transportation & Public Works
Number & Recommendation	Dead Establ			dlines eved	Implementa	tion Status	Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							ability to follow up on confirming the status of deficiencies noted as open in VFA as soon as practical.  February Response:  As a part of the DAS-FM Director mandated county-wide annual building inspection program being worked on by DAS_FM staff, the PM Units will be required to document their review of the VFA data.  DAS-FM staff will work with all PM Units and DAS fiscal and budget staff to develop a process and procedure that requires PM Units to review all open deficiencies and updat VFA to reflect their proper status, with emphasis directed toward budgeting in the operating or capital budget to address Priority 1, Life Safety deficiencies initially. Requested budget submittals will require back up documentation from the VFA database. This process and procedure will include access and training on the appropria property management software.  A challenge to this process is the lack of staff and resource for the PM Unit to allocate time for those with the expertise necessary.  It is not DAS involvement and/or limitations with staff's knowledge of VFA functions but lack of staff and resources for the PM Unit to allocate time for those with
<ol> <li>Develop a strategy and timetable for existing systems in the County, and</li> </ol>		No			No	Yes	the expertise necessary that restricts PM units' ability to follow up on confirming the status of deficiencies noted open in VFA as soon as they should.  August 2011 Response:  Based on existing County Ordinance Section 56.20, DTPV

Number & Recommendation	Deadlines Established		Deadlines Achieved		Implementation Status		Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
other available systems, to achieve a comprehensive property management system to become fully operational for preparation of the 2013 County Budget.							staff is developing a DTPW Director mandated county-wide annual building inspection program for "maintaining structural integrity of all capital improvements and routine major maintenance." In the 2011 Adopted Budget 5 skille trade positions were created but not funded for Building Inspections. Additionally, in 2010 consultants hired by DTPW found approximately \$2.9 million in repairs that we needed in 2011 for the buildings that were inspected in 2010. The money that was earmarked to make those repairs came from the UWM Land Sales. When the land sales were deferred, funding was lost to make the repairs 2011. In February of 2011and again in April reports were sent to the County Board highlighting these issues. The County will need to plan for funding in 2012 to make these repairs and fund the inspection team positions. Once the DTPW inspection team has been assembled, they will be visiting all County facilities on an annual basis using a recently developed "Inspection Manual for Building Components and Other Structures". Inspection reports we be generated and submitted to the PM Units with the directive to implement any repair or removal of imminent threat to employee or public safety. If, upon revisiting the facilities, the directed repair or removal of imminent threat and the process is the lack of staff and resour for the PM Units to allocate time for those with the expert necessary.
						A CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTRACTOR	While some existing systems may be appropriate for ce activities, newer systems may be available that create single source for warehousing data, estimating costs, to progress and generating reports for multiple users.

						Comments
Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
					Nequired	Therefore, DPTW staff will perform an analysis of the curre county data systems, along with the possible integration of new systems including enterprise GIS, to provide a streamlined approach to building condition and assessme management.  February 2012 Response:  Based on existing County Ordinance Section 56.20, DAS FM staff is developing a DAS Director mandated countywide annual building inspection program for "maintaining structural integrity of all capital improvements and routine major maintenance." In the 2011 Adopted Budget 5 skille trade positions were created but not funded for Building Inspections. Additionally, in 2010 consultants hired by DTPW found approximately \$2.9 million in repairs that we needed in 2011 for the buildings that were inspected in 2010. The money that was earmarked to make those repairs came from the UWM Land Sales. When the land sales were deferred, funding was lost to make the repairs 2011. In February of 2011and again in April reports were sent to the County Board highlighting these issues.  In September, 2011 a fund transfer from DAS-Fiscal was approved by the County Board to provide \$1,015,441 in sales tax proceeds to complete façade repairs on building in 9 different Count Departments. On 9/29/2011, the DTD Director sent a letter to the impacted department heads at their appropriate staff with a description, budget and time for completing these repairs. These repairs are currently

Number & Recommendation	Deadlines Established		Deadlines Achieved		Implementation Status		Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							DAS agrees that consolidation of all county owned propert should be under one property management function as proposed both by an earlier audit report as well as a previous budget request. As out-lined in the 2012 Adopted Budget and in subsequent informational reports to the County Board, DAS-FM has been created to ensure building management is streamlined and that maintenance of count owned property is prioritized in an unbiased manner with safety as the priority. The adopted budget action creating DAS-FM is the first step in consolidating all property management functions Countywide within DAS to provide the benefits noted in the 2010 Audit report. Subsequent budget initiatives to further consolidate all property management functions Countywide under DAS-FM are anticipated in 2013.  On a related initiative, per the 2012 Adopted Budget, DAS-FM is in the process of negotiating a contract we consulting firm of CB Richard Ellis to deliver a Comprehensive Facilities Plan for County buildings a properties. This plan will provide a strategy, timeline and cost estimates to implement the Milwaukee County property management strategic plan  Once the DAS-FM inspection team has been assembled, they will be visiting all County facilities on an annual basis using a recently developed "Inspection Manual for Buildin Components and Other Structures". Inspection reports we be generated and submitted to the PM Units with the directive to implement any repair or removal of imminent threat to employee or public safety. If, upon revisiting the facilities, the directed repair or removal of imminent threat.

Audit Date: October 2010	Status Rep	ort Da	ite: F	ebruary	16, 2012	Depa	rtment: Transportation & Public Works
Number & Recommendation	}	Deadlines Established		dlines ieved	Implementation Status		Comments
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Completed	Further Action Required	
							has not been completed, a report to the County Board will be generated.  A challenge to this process is the lack of staff and resources for the PM Units to allocate time for those with the expertise necessary.  While some existing systems may be appropriate for certain activities, newer systems may be available that create a single source for warehousing data, estimating costs, track progress and generating reports for multiple users. Therefore, DAS-FM staff will perform an analysis of the current county data systems, along with the possible integration of new systems including enterprise GIS, to provide a streamlined approach to building condition and